

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
10 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
11

12 ANDREW DOMINGUEZ, on behalf of
13 himself and all others similarly situated
14 and the general public,

15 Plaintiff,

16 vs.

17 UNITED PARCEL SERVICE, CO., a
18 Delaware corporation and DOES 1
19 through 50, inclusive,

20 Defendants.
21

22 Case No. 5:18-cv-01162 JGB (SPx)

23 **STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
24 ORDER**

25 Courtroom: 1

26 Judge: Hon. Jesus G. Bernal

1 J. SCOTT RUSSO (SB# 155631)
2 RUSSO & DUCKWORTH, LLP
3 2801 West Coast Highway, Suite 270
4 Newport Beach, CA 92663
5 Telephone: (949) 752-7106
6 Facsimile: (949) 752-0629

7 ROBERT E. BRIGHT (SB# 166341)
8 LAW OFFICE OF ROBERT E. BRIGHT
9 2801 West Coast Highway, Suite 270
10 Newport Beach, CA 92663
11 Telephone: (949) 396-2406
12 Facsimile: (949) 396-2561

13 Attorneys for Plaintiff and all others similarly situated

14 ELIZABETH A. BROWN (SB# 235429)
15 JENNIFER SVANFELDT (SB# 233248)
16 AMANDA BOLLIGER CRESPO (SB# 250292)

17 MATTHEW W. MORRIS (SB# 309741)

18 lisabrown@gbgllp.com

19 jensvanfeldt@gbgllp.com

20 amandacrespo@gbgllp.com

21 mattmorris@gbgllp.com

22 GBG LLP

23 633 West 5th Street, Suite 3330

24 Los Angeles, CA 90071

25 Telephone: (213) 358-2810

26 Facsimile: (213) 995-6382

27 Attorneys for Defendant

28 UNITED PARCEL SERVICE, INC.

1 **1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
5 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
6 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
7 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
8 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
9 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
10 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth
11 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
12 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
13 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a
14 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

15 **B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

16 This action is likely to involve the exchange of records and information
17 referencing or otherwise reflecting certain business practices, internal procedures,
18 customer information, and other valuable research, development,
19 commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which
20 special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other
21 than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such protected materials/information
22 consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial
23 information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other
24 confidential research, development, or commercial information (including
25 information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise
26 generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise
27 protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case
28 decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to

1 facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery
2 materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep
3 confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses
4 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their
5 handling at the end of the litigation, and to serve the ends of justice, a protective
6 order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties
7 that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that
8 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been
9 maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it
10 should not be part of the public record of this case.

11

12 **2. DEFINITIONS**

13 2.1 Action: The above-captioned case, *Andrew Dominguez, on behalf of*
14 *himself and all others similarly situated and the general public, v. United Parcel*
15 *Service, Co., a Delaware corporation and DOES 1 through 50, inclusive*, (C.D.
16 Cal. Case No. 5:18-cv-01162 JGB (SPx)).

17 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
18 designation of information or items under this Order.

19 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
20 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
21 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
22 the Good Cause Statement.

23 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
24 their support staff).

25 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
26 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
27 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

28 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless

1 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
2 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced
3 or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

4 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
5 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
6 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

7 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
8 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
9 counsel.

10 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
11 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

12 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a
13 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
14 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
15 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

16 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
17 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
18 support staff).

19 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
20 Discovery Material in this Action.

21 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
22 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
23 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
24 and their employees and subcontractors.

25 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
26 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

27 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
28 Material from a Producing Party.

1 **3. SCOPE**

2 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
3 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
4 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
5 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
6 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

7 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
8 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

9

10 **4. DURATION**

11 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
12 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
13 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
14 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action,
15 with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
16 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
17 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
18 pursuant to applicable law.

19

20 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

21 **5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.**

22 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection
23 under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material
24 that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must
25 designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or
26 written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material,
27 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not
28 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

1 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
2 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
3 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to
4 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the
5 Designating Party to sanctions.

6 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
7 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
8 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

9 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
10 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
11 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
12 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
13 produced.

14 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

15 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
16 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
17 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
18 “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that
19 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
20 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
21 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

22 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for
23 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party
24 has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the
25 inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for
26 inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has
27 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must
28 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this

1 Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must
2 affix the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material.
3 If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
4 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
5 appropriate markings in the margins).

6 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
7 identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
8 deposition all protected testimony.

9 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
10 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place
11 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
12 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information
13 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
14 protected portion(s).

15 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
16 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
17 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such
18 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
19 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
20 provisions of this Order.

21

22 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

23 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
24 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
25 Scheduling Order.

26 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
27 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 *et seq.*

28 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on

1 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
2 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
3 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
4 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
5 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
6 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
7 challenge.

8

9 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

10 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
11 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
12 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
13 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
14 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
15 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
16 DISPOSITION).

17 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
18 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
19 authorized under this Order.

20 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
21 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
22 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
23 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

24 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action,
25 as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
26 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

27 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House
28 Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this

1 Action;

2 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to
3 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
4 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

5 (d) the court and its personnel;

6 (e) court reporters and their staff;

7 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and

8 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action
9 and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit
10 A);

11 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information
12 or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

13 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses,
14 in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the
15 deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto;
16 and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they
17 sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless
18 otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of
19 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected
20 Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to
21 anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

22 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting
23 personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement
24 discussions.

25

26 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**
PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

27 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
28 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as

1 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

- 2 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such
3 notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
- 4 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or
5 order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
6 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall
7 include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- 8 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
9 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

10 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party
11 served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information
12 designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court
13 from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the
14 Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and
15 expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing
16 in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving
17 Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

18

19 **9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
20 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

21 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
22 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
23 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
24 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
25 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

26 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
27 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
28 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

1 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
2 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

3 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
4 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other
5 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal
6 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify
7 whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for
8 production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
9 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure
10 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work
11 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated
12 protective order submitted to the court.

13 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

14 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
15 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

16 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
17 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
18 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in
19 this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on
20 any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective
21 Order.

22 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
23 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material
24 may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
25 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
26 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
27 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

1 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

2 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
3 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must
4 return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As
5 used in this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts,
6 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the
7 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the
8 Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if
9 not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that
10 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was
11 returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any
12 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
13 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel
14 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
15 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition
16 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
17 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such
18 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to
19 this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

20 //

21 //

22 //

23 //

24 //

25 //

26 //

27 //

28 //

1 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
2 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
3 sanctions.

4

5 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

6 DATED: November 12, 2019 RUSSO & DUCKWORTH, LLP
7 LAW OFFICES OF ROBERT E. BRIGHT

8

9 BY: /s/ Robert E. Bright
10 Robert E. Bright

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff
12 ANDREW DOMINGUEZ

13 DATED: November 12, 2019 GBG LLP

14

15 BY: /s/ Elizabeth A. Brown
16 Elizabeth A. Brown

17 Attorneys for Defendant
18 UNITED PARCEL SERVICE, INC.

19 The undersigned attests that the signatory listed above concurs in the content
20 of this document and has authorized its filing.

21 DATED: November 12, 2019 GBG LLP

22

23 BY: /s/ Elizabeth A. Brown
24 Elizabeth A. Brown

25 Attorneys for Defendant
26 UNITED PARCEL SERVICE, INC.

27 //

28 //

1 **FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**
2
3

4
5 DATED: November 13, 2019
6

7 
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Hon. Sheri Pym
United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address],
declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand
the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District
Court for the Central District of California on _____ [date] in the case of,
*Andrew Dominguez, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated and the
general public, v. United Parcel Service, Co., a Delaware corporation and DOES 1
through 50, inclusive*, (C.D. Cal. Case No. 5:18-cv-01162 JGB (SPx)). I agree to
comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order
and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to
sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will
not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated
Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the
provisions of this Order.

17 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
18 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
19 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
20 termination of this action. I hereby appoint: _____

21 [print or type full name] of _____ [print
22 or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of
23 process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of
24 this Stipulated Protective Order.

25 Date: _____

26 | City and State where sworn and signed: _____

27 Printed name: _____

28 || Signature: _____